[30th March 1928

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" May I request the hon. the Chief Minister to kindly elucidate his cryptic statement that he sees no inconsistency between Devolution Rule No. 5 and the vote of this House? I am asking, Sir, how he reconciles or proposes to reconcile the vote of this House which says that this House including my hon. Friend, the Minister, shall not have anything to do with the Simon Commission as it is at present constituted and the preparation of materials for submission to the Commission."

The hon. Dr. P. SUBBARAYAN :—" I have already answered this question, Sir, and it is for my hon. and learned Friend for the University to draw any inference he chooses from that statement."

Mr. T. C. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" May I ask the hon. the First Minister to tell us whether he has tendered any advice, not that I ask what advice he tendered ?"

The hon. Dr. P. SUBBARAYAN :—" I am not prepared to answer that question."

Mr. T. C. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" I want to know, Sir, whether a resolution of the House once passed should be considered as binding on the Ministers and am I not entitled to ask whether he has tendered any advice at all ? "

Mr. ABDUL HAMID KHAN :—" May I know, Sir, from the hon. the Minister if he is not aware that a similar situation arose in the Central Provinces and that the Ministers there did not think it advisible to give preference to Devolution Rule No. 5 over a vote of the House ? "

The hon. Dr. P. SUBBARAYAN :—" I have nothing to do with the action of the Ministers in the Central Provinces."

Mr. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—" May I know, Sir, whether the hon. the Minister has written to the Government of India that in view of the vote of the House he is not going to take any action on the letter ? I ask, Sir, if he has replied to the Government of India's letter that in view of the vote of this House, he is not prepared to take action on their letter."

The hon. Dr. P. SUBBARAYAN :—" I cannot answer that question." (Several voices : Why not ? A voice : He dare not.)

Mr. P. ANJANEYULU :—" May I know whether the Minister is aware that the vote of this House is binding on him and the other two Ministers ? "

The hon. Dr. P. SUBBARAYAN :—" I do not think the vote of the House means what the hon. Member says." (Laughter and cries 'Oh, Oh'.)

Instructions for preparing matter for presentation to the Simon Commission.

*1846 Q.—Mr. S. SATYAMURTI : Will the hon. the Minister for Public Health be pleased to state--

(a) whether he has given or proposes to give any official instructions to the departments under his control for the preparation of any case or materials for presentation to or consideration by the Simon Commission ;

(b) if so, the reasons why the Minister proposes to act in contravention of the resolution of this Council not to co-operate ?

30th March 1928]

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Sir, may I ask the hon. the Minister for Public Health whether he also sees no inconsistency between the vote of the House and his own vote a few weeks ago in favour of boycotting the Commission and his present position ? "

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The Second Minister has not given his oral answers to the questions yet."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" My answer, Sir, is that it does not fall to the Ministers to supply any information to the Royal Commission."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Sir, I do not propose to go through the painful process of putting a series of questions and getting at the 'Yes' in the end. I take it that the answer given by the Chief Minister is accepted by this Minister also and will proceed from there. I am asking my hon. Friend, Sir, whether he, first of all, formally accepts the position as adumbrated by his 'Chief' and secondly, if he does, whether he sees no inconsistency between his own vote in favour of having nothing to do with the Simon Commission as at present constituted and his now asking the departments under his charge to prepare evidence for submission to the Commission under Devolution Rule No. 5 ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" That is a matter of opinion, Sir. It is not a fact on which a supplementary question can be asked by an hon. Member."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" It is not a matter of opinion ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, it is for you to rule on that point and not my hon. Friend."

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I think the hon. Member might repeat his question."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Yes, Sir. I was asking whether he accepts the position as adumbrated by his Chief, the First Minister, and if so, whether he also sees no inconsistency between the vote of the House in which he participated for boycotting the Royal Commission and having nothing to do with the Commission as at present constituted and the work of the departments in his charge in preparing evidence for submission to the Commission, directly or in the ultimate resort ? "

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I do not find any seeking for an opinion there." (Swarajist cheers.)

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" If it is not a matter of opinion, Sir, my opinion is that I do not see any inconsistency."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" May I therefore ask him, Sir, to kindly give some elucidation whether if the departments under his control prepare evidence for the use of the Commission under his direction, it is carrying out the vote of this House and his own vote in favour of having nothing to do with the Commission ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" The hon. the Chief Minister has said that no instructions have been issued."

[30th March 1928

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" I am asking, Sir, my hon. Friend whether he is aware that, in pursuance of orders received from the Government of India under Devolution Rule No. 5, the departments now under his control are engaged in the preparation of evidence for the Simon Commission and, if so, whether he proposes to or has issued any instructions ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" I have not issued instructions and when the necessity for action arises, the matter will be considered."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Is the hon. Minister aware whether his departments are engaged in the preparation of evidence in this connexion and may I ask if and when his departments are called upon by the Government of India or by his Chief Minister to prepare evidence, he proposes to countermand that order and carry out the vote of the House and his own vote ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" It is a matter for future action on which I am not prepared to answer."

Mr. T. C. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" May I know from the Second Minister if he is still of the same opinion as what he held when he voted for the motion ? " (Hear, hear.)

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" I submit, Mr. President, that questions are to be put on matters of fact and not on matters of opinion This, I submit, is a matter of opinion."

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Will the hon. Member kindly repeat his question ? "

Mr. T. C. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" I asked, Sir, if the Minister is of the same opinion now as he was when he voted for the resolution."

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" It is distinctly calling for opinion. The hon. Member will be at liberty to put it in another form."

Mr. T. C. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" Will the Second Minister tell us if he still adheres to the opinion that he previously held or has he changed it ? "

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Now that is a question of fact and is in order."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, the opinion which I then expressed and that which I express now are not inconsistent."

Mr. P. ANJANEYULU :—" May I know whether when he accepted this office he made any statement that he had changed his opinion as regards the vote on the Simon Commission ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" That is a matter which, I am afraid, I cannot divulge and for which there is no necessity whatever."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Can I ask my hon. Friend categorically whether he did or did not tell somebody that he will undertake not to oppose the Commission ? "

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Sir, it is a very vague question. Unless the Member says who that somebody is, I cannot answer him."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Sir, it is the Governor of Madras."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Sir, the conversation between me and the Governor is confidential and I cannot talk about it."

Instructions for preparing matter for presentation to the Simon Commission.

* 1847 Q.—Mr. S. SATYAMURTI : Will the hon. the Minister for Development be pleased to state—

(*a*) whether he has given or proposes to give any official instructions to the departments under his control for the preparation of any case or materials for presentation to or consideration by the Simon Commission ;

(*b*) if so, the reasons why the Minister proposes to act in contravention of the resolution of this Council not to co-operate ?

The President then called on the hon. the Third Minister to give his answers to the question.

The hon. Mr. M. R. SETURATNAM AYYAR :—" Sir, I give the same answer as my hon. Colleagues have done, that the Ministers are not called upon to give information to the Simon Commission."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Order, order. The time allotted for questions is over. (Loud laughter.)

" The Raja of Ramnad gave notice of a special urgent question and the Minister for Development has given his consent to waive short notice and answer the question, and he is prepared to answer it at 3 p.m. The question will be taken up at 3 o'clock after lunch."

Mr. A. RANGANATHA MUDALIYAR :—" As a matter of information, Sir, may I ask why the questions Nos. 1845, 1846 and 1847, were not put down for answer yesterday ? Because I find that the other questions, notice of which were given on the 23rd March have been marked for being answered on the 29th, whereas I do not find any date marked for these three questions." 12 noon.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The first date shows when the question was received in the office. The third date shows when the answer was received from the Government, not when the answer was due."

Mr. SAMI VENKATACHALAM CHETTI :—" May I just remind you, Sir, of your promise that we might reopen the question with regard to Mr. Slater approaching Mr. Ramjee Rao, when he is here ? Will you please permit it to be taken along with the other question as a special case ? "

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I want to know what the hon. the Leader of the House has to say in this matter."

The hon. Sir NORMAN MARJORIBANKS :—" I do not know on what point exactly my opinion is asked, Sir. I certainly do not propose to give the hon. Member any facilities for going through it again."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" As the hon. the Leader of the House, does not propose to give any facilities for that, I cannot allow this to be taken up this evening.

" The Council will now take up the Budget Demands."

(For Starred Question No. 1847-A, please see page 250 infra.)